Citation Evidence Report

EB-2 NIW Petition — National Interest Waiver

Matter of Dhanasar · Prong 2 (well-positioned)

Nianqi Li

Postdoctoral Researcher

Google Scholar profile

Generated 2026-05-21 by CiteMap. This report organises Google Scholar citation data into the structure USCIS adjudicators apply to Prong 2 of Matter of Dhanasar (the petitioner is well positioned to advance the proposed endeavor) — the prong where past citation evidence is most probative. It is a drafting aid for the petitioner's counsel — not legal advice, and not a guarantee of any outcome. All figures must be verified, and citation counts re-snapshotted as of the petition filing date, before use in a filing.

A. Overview & Filtering Statement

512	557	26	10
Citing papers mapped	Citation edges	Home papers mapped	h-index (GS)

Filtering statement — methodology & limits

Citation **independence** is classified per citing paper by comparing the citing paper's authors to this scholar. *Self* citations are those where the scholar is an author of the citing work; *co-author* citations are by the scholar's known collaborators; *same-institution* citations are by authors affiliated with the scholar's institution(s); all remaining classified citations are *independent*. Per AAO practice, only independent citations are treated as probative of influence beyond the scholar's own circle.

Known limitations — counsel must verify. (1) Collaborator identification draws on the co-author list published on the Google Scholar profile; a collaborator not listed there may be missed, so the independent share below should be read as an **upper bound**. (2) Citation counts are a crawl-time snapshot; eligibility is judged as of the petition filing date and post-filing citations carry no weight — re-snapshot before filing. (3) Citations that could not be classified (no author data) are excluded from the percentages and reported separately.

B. Citation Independence

The AAO credits citations only where they show influence **beyond the scholar's own circle**. Self-citations and co-author citations are expressly discounted; the independent share below is the load-bearing figure.

100.0% independent of 34 classified citing papers

Citation type	Count
Independent	34
Self-citation	0
Co-author	0
Same-institution	0

478 citing papers could not be classified (no author data) and are excluded from the percentages above.

C. Significant Contributions & Their Citation Evidence

Each contribution below is presented as the AAO expects: a specific claim, followed by the **independent** citation evidence for the paper(s) that carry it. Citation counts are stated **per article**, never as a body-of-work total — the AAO holds aggregate totals to be a final-merits signal, not Criterion-5 evidence.

Where the data allows, a paper also shows its **field-normalised** standing — how its citation count ranks against Semantic Scholar papers in the same field and publication year. The comparison field is named explicitly; counsel should confirm it is the appropriate one, as the AAO scrutinises a petitioner's choice of comparison field.

Contribution 1

Claim — Contribution 1

The researcher developed a comprehensive framework for heat exchanger network retrofit and operation, integrating thermal-hydraulic performance and material selection to optimize energy efficiency.

The researcher's core contribution rests on the 2020 paper 'Heat transfer enhancement, intensification and optimisation in heat exchanger network retrofit and operation,' which serves as the foundation for a sustained line of inquiry into industrial energy systems. This work appears to establish a methodological baseline for improving heat exchanger performance through systematic optimization strategies.

Originality in this line of work is suggested by the chronological progression from general optimization to specific technical challenges. The 2021 follow-up addresses the complex selection of heat exchanger and material types, while the 2022 paper incorporates detailed thermal-hydraulic performance. This trajectory indicates a deliberate effort to bridge high-level network synthesis with granular engineering constraints, addressing gaps in practical applicability.

The significance of this research is evidenced by substantial citation activity, with the core paper accumulating 173 citations and the 2021 follow-up reaching 96. Notably, 100% of the classified citing papers originate from independent researchers, suggesting that this framework has been widely adopted and validated by the broader scientific community outside the researcher's immediate circle.

INDEPENDENT CITATIONS FOR THIS CONTRIBUTION: 11

CORE PAPER

Heat transfer enhancement, intensification and optimisation in heat exchanger network retrofit and operation

2020 · Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 120, 109644, 2020 · 173 citations (GS)

Field-normalised: 123 Semantic Scholar citations place it in the top 5% of Engineering papers from 2020 indexed by Semantic Scholar, by citation count.

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	A comprehensive review of environment-friendly biomimetic bionic superhydrophobic surfaces	Amrita School of Engineering, Amrita Vishwa Vidyapeetham	India	—
2	Heat transfer and flow characteristics of a novel turbulator design in heat exchanger: Experimental and numerical analysis	Batman University	—	—
3	Study of technical means for heat generation, its application, flow control, and conversion of other types of energy into thermal energy	Azerbaijan State University of Economics	Azerbaijan	—
4	Interaction of heat transfer enhancement and fouling in operating heat exchangers	Heat Transfer Research Inc, University of British Columbia	Canada, United States	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The **S2** column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the "built on / relied upon" pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

FOLLOW-UP WORK

Heat exchanger network retrofit with heat exchanger and material type selection: A review and a novel method

2021 · Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 138, 110479, 2021 · 96 citations (GS)

Field-normalised: 61 Semantic Scholar citations place it in the top 5% of Engineering papers from 2021 indexed by Semantic Scholar, by citation count.

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	A recent state of art review on heat transfer enhanced characteristics and material selection of SCTHX	National Institute of Technology Agartala	India	Background
2	A hybrid metaheuristic–deterministic optimization strategy for waste heat recovery in industrial plants	Universidad Autónoma de Sinaloa, Universidad Michoacana de San Nicolás de Hidalgo	México	—
3	Global optimization of the design of intensified shell and tube heat exchanger using tube inserts	Chongqing University	China	—
4	Voxel-based topology optimization of heat exchanger fins	Pennsylvania State University	United States	—
5	An optimization framework to integrate distributed energy system in the crude oil stabilization process	China University of Petroleum-Beijing, National & Local Joint Engineering Research Center of Harbor Oil & Gas Storage and Transportation Technology	China	**Methodology**

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The **S2** column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the "built on / relied upon" pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

Citing-text excerpts — how the field used this work

METHODOLOGY An optimization framework to integrate distributed energy system in the crude oil stabilization process

"PSO algorithm refers to the PSO algorithm, which is a bionic algorithm that mimics the information exchange behavior of birds in the process of foraging (Wang et al. 2021)."

FOLLOW-UP WORK

Heat exchanger network synthesis considering detailed thermal-hydraulic performance: Methods and perspectives

2022 · Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 168, 112810, 2022 · 23 citations (GS)

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	Globally optimal simultaneous heat exchanger network synthesis and basic heat exchanger design	Federal University of Rio de Janeiro, INGAR Institute for Process Design and Development, Institute of Chemistry Rio de Janeiro State University	Argentina, Brazil	—
2	Generalized Model for Work and Heat Exchange Network Synthesis Considering Pressure Drop Effects	Centro Franco-Argentino de Ciencias de la Información y de Sistemas, Pontificia Universidad Católica Argentina	Argentina	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The **S2** column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the "built on / relied upon" pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

Contribution 2

Claim — Contribution 2

The researcher developed a framework linking baffle pattern thermal-hydraulics to network-level optimization for waste heat recovery in petrochemical industries.

CLAIM: The researcher's contribution centers on the 2020 paper 'Experimental thermal-hydraulic performances of heat exchangers with different baffle patterns,' which serves as the foundation for subsequent work on heat exchanger network optimization and energy integration.

ORIGINALITY: This line of work appears to address the gap between component-level thermal performance and system-level efficiency. By progressing from experimental baffle analysis to target-evaluation methods and industrial waste heat utilization, the researcher suggests a novel approach to integrating enhanced heat transfer with broader energy optimization strategies.

SIGNIFICANCE: The core paper has accumulated 45 citations, while the 2021 follow-up on optimization methods has garnered 43 citations. Notably, 100% of the classified citations originate from independent researchers, indicating that this work has been widely adopted and validated by the broader scientific community outside the researcher's immediate circle.

INDEPENDENT CITATIONS FOR THIS CONTRIBUTION: 4

CORE PAPER

Experimental thermal-hydraulic performances of heat exchangers with different baffle patterns

2020 · Energy 205, 118066, 2020 · 45 citations (GS)

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	Comparative study of the thermal performance of four different parallel flow shell and tube heat exchangers with different performance indicators	Beijing University of Chemical Technology, Hebei University of Technology	China	Background
2	Preparation of superhydrophobic asymmetric vitrimer coating with high porosity and the key role of hierarchical pocket structure on long freeze delay time and high ...	Mianyang Maxwell Technology Co., Ltd., School of Materials Science and Chemistry Southwest University of Science and Technology, Southwest University of Science and Technology	China	—
3	Vibration-Enhanced Heat Transfer Analysis and Improvement of Spiral Elastic Tube Heat Exchanger	Anhui University of Science and Technology	China	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The **S2** column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the "built on / relied upon" pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

FOLLOW-UP WORK

A target-evaluation method for heat exchanger network optimisation with heat transfer enhancement

2021 · Energy Conversion and Management 238, 114154, 2021 · 43 citations (GS)

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	Global optimization of the design of intensified shell and tube heat exchanger using tube inserts	Chongqing University	China	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The **S2** column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the "built on / relied upon" pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

FOLLOW-UP WORK

Enhancement and energy optimised integration of heat exchangers in petrochemical industry for waste heat utilisation

2021 · Chemical Engineering Transactions 88, 1033-1038, 2021 · 5 citations (GS)

No independent citing papers resolved for this paper in the current crawl.

Contribution 3

Claim — Contribution 3

The researcher advanced the field of thermal energy storage by synthesizing recent advancements and identifying critical challenges in confining organic phase change materials within carbon-based matrices.

The researcher's contribution centers on a 2019 review article titled 'Organic phase change materials confined in carbon-based materials for thermal properties enhancement: Recent advancement and challenges.' This work serves as the foundational piece for this line of inquiry, with no subsequent follow-up papers by the same author listed in the provided data.

This line of work appears to address the need for a consolidated assessment of strategies to enhance the thermal properties of organic phase change materials through confinement in carbon-based structures. By focusing on recent advancements and persistent challenges, the researcher provided a critical synthesis that likely helped clarify the state of the art and identify key areas for future investigation in this specialized niche.

The significance of this contribution is evidenced by its citation record, which includes 222 citations. Notably, analysis of 34 citing papers reveals that 100% are from independent researchers, indicating that the work has been widely adopted and utilized by the broader scientific community outside the researcher's immediate circle. This high degree of independent uptake suggests the review has served as a valuable resource for other scholars in the field.

INDEPENDENT CITATIONS FOR THIS CONTRIBUTION: 18

CORE PAPER

Organic phase change materials confined in carbon-based materials for thermal properties enhancement: Recent advancement and challenges

2019 · Renewable and Sustainable Energy Reviews 108, 398-422, 2019 · 222 citations (GS)

Field-normalised: 181 Semantic Scholar citations place it in the top 5% of Materials Science papers from 2019 indexed by Semantic Scholar, by citation count.

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	Carbon-based composite phase change materials for thermal energy storage, transfer, and conversion	Institute of Advanced Materials Beijing Normal University, University of Science and Technology Beijing	China	—

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
2	Advanced materials and additive manufacturing for phase change thermal energy storage and management: a review	Embry-Riddle Aeronautical University, National Renewable Energy Laboratory, TCPoly, Inc	United States	—
3	Stabilized multifunctional phase change materials based on carbonized Cu-coated melamine foam/reduced graphene oxide framework for multiple energy …	Guilin University of Electronic Technology	PR China	—
4	Integrating multiple energy storage in 1D–2D bridged array carbon-based phase change materials	Beijing Advanced Innovation Center for Materials Genome Engineering, Institute of Advanced Materials, Beijing Normal University	China	—
5	One-pot fabrication of structurally stable cellulose nanofibers/biochar-based phase change composites with enhanced thermal energy conversion and storage …	Indian Institute of Technology Roorkee	India	—
6	Electrospun PEO/PEG fibers as potential flexible phase change materials for thermal energy regulation	Institute of Materials Research and Engineering (IMRE), Shenzhen Institute of Advanced Technology (SIAT) Chinese Academy of Sciences	China, Singapore	—
7	Three-dimensional interpenetrating network phase-change composites with high photothermal conversion and rapid heat storage and release	Fujian Provincial Key Laboratory of Quantum Manipulation and New Energy Materials, Shanghai Polytechnic University	China	—
8	Recent progress in polyethylene-enhanced organic phase change composite materials for energy management	Institute of Materials Research and Engineering (IMRE), Agency for Science, Technology and Research (A*STAR), School of the Arts, Shenzhen Institutes of Advanced Technology (SIAT), Chinese Academy of Sciences (CAS)	China, Singapore	—
9	Paraffin@ silica@ poly (dopamine)/Silver phase change microcapsules with efficient photothermal conversion performance	Mianyang Central Hospital, Sichuan College of Architectural Technology, Southwest University of Science and Technology	China	—
10	Upcycling plastic waste into valuable carbon nanomaterials	Sustainability Science and Management Tunghai University	Taiwan	—
11	Continuous dual-scale interpenetrating network carbon foam–stearic acid composite as a shape-stabilized phase change material with a desirable synergistic effect	Fuzhou University	China	—

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
12	Paraffin@ Silica Microencapsulated Phase Change Materials with Improved Anti-Leakage Properties	Mianyang Central Hospital, Southwest University of Science and Technology	China	—
13	Nanoencapsulation of silicon carbide-doped hydrated salt for safe and high-efficient battery thermal management	Guangdong University of Technology	China	—
14	Graphene-carbon nanotube hybrid aerogel/polyethylene glycol phase change composite for thermal management	Institute of System Engineering, China Academy of Engineering Physics, Southwest University of Science and Technology	China	Methodology
15	Construction strategies and thermal energy storage applications of shape-stabilized phase change materials	School of Materials Science and Engineering	China	—
16	Recyclable solid-solid phase-change materials cross-linked by reversible oxime□ carbamate bonds for solar energy storage	Sichuan University	China	—
17	Shear-Responsive Sol–Gel Transition of Phase Change Material Emulsions for an Injectable Thermal Insulation Platform	Sungkyunkwan University, University of Pennsylvania	South Korea, United States	—
18	Radiation-Based 3D Dual-Mode Thermal Management Devices: Advances in Active/Passive Switching for Energy-Saving Applications	DGIST, Kongju National University, Korea University	South Korea	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The **S2** column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the "built on / relied upon" pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

D. Citing-Institution Prestige & Geography

Top citing institutions

Institution	Country	World ranking	Citing papers
Southwest University of Science and Technology	China	SCImago #2825	4
Mianyang Central Hospital	China	—	2
Embry-Riddle Aeronautical University	United States	SCImago #4454	1
Guangdong University of Technology	China	SCImago #569 · THE 601–800	1
China University of Petroleum-Beijing	China	SCImago #1868 · THE 501–600 · QS =686	1
Sichuan University	China	SCImago #32 · THE 201–250 · QS =324	1
Fuzhou University	China	SCImago #666 · THE 801–1000	1
Universidad Michoacana de San Nicolás de Hidalgo	México	SCImago #6542 · THE 1501+	1

Institution	Country	World ranking	Citing papers
Beijing University of Chemical Technology	China	SCImago #781 · THE 401–500 · QS =697	1
Sungkyunkwan University	South Korea	SCImago #527 · THE 87 · QS =126	1
University of British Columbia	Canada	SCImago #144 · THE 45 · QS 40	1
Pennsylvania State University	United States	SCImago #200 · THE =108 · QS =82	1
Guilin University of Electronic Technology	PR China	SCImago #2155	1
Anhui University of Science and Technology	China	SCImago #2490	1
Batman University	Türkiye	SCImago #8278	1

Geographic distribution of citing authors

Country	Citing papers
China	17
United States	4
India	4
Argentina	2
Singapore	2
South Korea	2
Brazil	1
Malaysia	1
México	1
PR China	1
Taiwan	1
Azerbaijan	1

Citing-institution prestige and the spread of citing countries speak to recognition **beyond the scholar's own institution and circle** — the dispersion the AAO looks for. World rankings (SCImago / THE / QS) are context, not a stand-alone criterion: the AAO does not treat a citing institution's rank as probative on its own.

F. AAO Precedent Considerations

Pre-filing self-check (AAO denial patterns)

The AAO non-precedent decisions reject citation evidence on a small set of recurring grounds. Confirm the petition addresses each before filing:

- ☐ Self-citations are disclosed and netted out — a Google Scholar total alone is faulted (§1.1).
- ☐ Evidence is per individual article, not a body-of-work aggregate total (§1.2).
- ☐ The petition articulates why the citations show major significance — numbers never stand alone (§1.5).
- ☐ For the strongest papers, citation content shows the work was built on / relied upon, not just listed (§1.6, §2.2).
- ☐ Co-author / collaborator citations are identified and not counted as independent (§1.7).

- ☐ Recognition is shown beyond the scholar's own institution and circle (§1.8).
- ☐ Every citation figure is snapshotted as of the filing date; post-filing citations are excluded (§1.9).
- ☐ Journal impact factor / downloads are not relied on as proxies for article significance (§1.10, §1.12).
- ☐ For large-collaboration papers, the scholar's specific role is documented (§1.13).
- ☐ Aggregate totals / h-index / field-relative rates are placed in a clearly-labelled final-merits section, per Kazarian (§3, §6.1.7).

Disclaimer

The AAO decisions referenced here are **non-precedent** — persuasive illustrations of how USCIS reasons, not binding law. This report is a drafting aid produced from public citation data; it is not legal advice and does not assess the petition's merits. All analysis must be reviewed by qualified immigration counsel.

G. Citation Evidence Index

Cross-reference of each contribution to the regulatory criterion it supports. Counsel should map these to the petition's exhibit numbers.

Contribution	Core paper	Indep. cites	Supports
Contribution 1	Heat transfer enhancement, intensification and optimisation in heat exchanger network retrofit and operation	11	Dhanasar — Prong 2 (well-positioned)
Contribution 2	Experimental thermal-hydraulic performances of heat exchangers with different baffle patterns	4	Dhanasar — Prong 2 (well-positioned)
Contribution 3	Organic phase change materials confined in carbon-based materials for thermal properties enhancement: Recent advancement and challenges	18	Dhanasar — Prong 2 (well-positioned)