Citation Evidence Report

EB-1B Petition — Outstanding Professor or Researcher

8 CFR § 204.5(i)(3) · Authorship + Original Contributions

Tonya Ward

Diversigen, Inc.

Google Scholar profile

Generated 2026-05-22 by CiteMap. This report organises Google Scholar citation data into the structure USCIS adjudicators apply to the 8 CFR § 204.5(i)(3) outstanding-researcher criteria — particularly (iii) published material and (v) original scientific or scholarly contributions. It is a drafting aid for the petitioner's counsel — not legal advice, and not a guarantee of any outcome. All figures must be verified, and citation counts re-snapshotted as of the petition filing date, before use in a filing.

A. Overview & Filtering Statement

8	8	1	24
Citing papers mapped	Citation edges	Home papers mapped	h-index (GS)

Filtering statement — methodology & limits

Citation **independence** is classified per citing paper by comparing the citing paper's authors to this scholar. *Self* citations are those where the scholar is an author of the citing work; *co-author* citations are by the scholar's known collaborators; *same-institution* citations are by authors affiliated with the scholar's institution(s); all remaining classified citations are *independent*. Per AAO practice, only independent citations are treated as probative of influence beyond the scholar's own circle.

Known limitations — counsel must verify. (1) Collaborator identification draws on the co-author list published on the Google Scholar profile; a collaborator not listed there may be missed, so the independent share below should be read as an **upper bound**. (2) Citation counts are a crawl-time snapshot; eligibility is judged as of the petition filing date and post-filing citations carry no weight — re-snapshot before filing. (3) Citations that could not be classified (no author data) are excluded from the percentages and reported separately.

B. Citation Independence

The AAO credits citations only where they show influence **beyond the scholar's own circle**. Self-citations and co-author citations are expressly discounted; the independent share below is the load-bearing figure.

100.0% independent of 8 classified citing papers

Citation type	Count
Independent	8
Self-citation	0
Co-author	0
Same-institution	0

0 citing papers could not be classified (no author data) and are excluded from the percentages above.

C. Significant Contributions & Their Citation Evidence

Each contribution below is presented as the AAO expects: a specific claim, followed by the **independent** citation evidence for the paper(s) that carry it. Citation counts are stated **per article**, never as a body-of-work total — the AAO holds aggregate totals to be a final-merits signal, not Criterion-5 evidence.

Where the data allows, a paper also shows its **field-normalised** standing — how its citation count ranks against Semantic Scholar papers in the same field and publication year. The comparison field is named explicitly; counsel should confirm it is the appropriate one, as the AAO scrutinises a petitioner's choice of comparison field.

Contribution 1

Claim — Contribution 1

The researcher published a seminal study in Cell demonstrating that US immigration significantly alters the human gut microbiome, establishing a critical link between migration and microbial ecology.

CLAIM: The researcher's primary contribution is the publication of a foundational paper in Cell titled "US immigration westernizes the human gut microbiome," which investigates the impact of migration on human microbial composition.

ORIGINALITY: This work appears to address a significant gap in understanding how major life transitions, specifically immigration to Western societies, reshape the human gut microbiome. By focusing on the intersection of migration and microbiology, the researcher provided a novel perspective on environmental and cultural influences on human health.

SIGNIFICANCE: The paper has been highly cited, indicating substantial uptake by the scientific community. Notably, citation analysis reveals that 100% of the classified citing papers originate from independent researchers, suggesting that the work has sparked broad, external interest and validation across the field rather than relying on internal or collaborative citations.

INDEPENDENT CITATIONS FOR THIS CONTRIBUTION: 8

CORE PAPER

US immigration westernizes the human gut microbiome

2018 · Cell · 907 citations (GS)

Field-normalised: 638 Semantic Scholar citations place it in the top 1% of Environmental Science papers from 2018 indexed by Semantic Scholar, by citation count.

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	Gut-microbiota-targeted diets modulate human immune status (2021)	Chan Zuckerberg Biohub, Stanford School of Medicine, Stanford University	United States	—
2	The interplay between diet and the gut microbiome: implications for health and disease (2024)	University College Cork	Ireland	—
3	Examining the healthy human microbiome concept (2024)	Baker Heart and Diabetes Institute, Center for Advanced Biotechnology and Medicine, Rutgers University, Centre de Recherche Saint Antoine, Sorbonne Université, INSERM	Australia, Belgium, China	—
4	Carbohydrate-active enzymes (CAZymes) in the gut microbiome (2022)	University of British Columbia	Canada	—
5	The person-to-person transmission landscape of the gut and oral microbiomes (2023)	Bernhard Nocht Institute for Tropical Medicine, IEO European Institute of Oncology IRCCS, Institute of Agrochemistry and Food Technology-National	Argentina, Austria, China	—
6	The Role of the Gut Microbiota in the Relationship Between Diet and Human Health (2023)	University of Pennsylvania	United States	—

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
7	Gut microbial metabolites as multi-kingdom intermediates (2020)	Morgridge Institute for Research; University of Wisconsin-Madison, University of Gothenburg, University of Wisconsin-Madison	Sweden, United States	—
8	The microbiome and gut homeostasis (2022)	School of California at Davis, University of California at Davis	United States	Background

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The **S2** column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the "built on / relied upon" pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

D. Citing-Institution Prestige & Geography

Top citing institutions

Institution	Country	World ranking	Citing papers
University College Cork	Ireland	SCImago #1176 · THE 351–400 · QS 246	2
Technical University of Denmark	Denmark	SCImago #404 · THE 121 · QS 107	1
Imperial College London	United Kingdom	SCImago #69 · THE 8 · QS 2	1
Xi'an Jiaotong University	China	SCImago #58 · THE 201–250 · QS 305	1
Charité – Universitätsmedizin Berlin	Germany	SCImago #284 · THE 91	1
London School of Hygiene and Tropical Medicine	United Kingdom	SCImago #802	1
Tongji University	China	SCImago #82 · THE =141 · QS =177	1
Utrecht University	Netherlands	SCImago #162 · QS =103	1
University of Vienna	Austria	THE =95 · QS 152	1
University of Gothenburg	Sweden	SCImago #573 · THE 201–250 · QS 202	1
University of Turku	Finland	SCImago #1389 · THE 301–350 · QS 366	1
University of Maryland School of Medicine	United States	—	1
Friedrich Schiller University Jena	Germany	SCImago #1106 · THE 201–250	1
KU Leuven	Belgium	SCImago #180 · THE 46 · QS 60	1
Chan Zuckerberg Biohub	United States	SCImago #146	1

Geographic distribution of citing authors

Country	Citing papers
United States	5

Country	Citing papers
Germany	2
Ireland	2
United Kingdom	2
China	2
Colombia	1
Denmark	1
Finland	1
France	1
Ghana	1
India	1
Italy	1

Citing-institution prestige and the spread of citing countries speak to recognition **beyond the scholar's own institution and circle** — the dispersion the AAO looks for. World rankings (SCImago / THE / QS) are context, not a stand-alone criterion: the AAO does not treat a citing institution's rank as probative on its own.

E. Citation Growth Over Time

Distinct citing papers by publication year. Sustained or rising citation activity supports continuing relevance; note that only citations **as of the filing date** are weighed by USCIS.

F. AAO Precedent Considerations

Pre-filing self-check (AAO denial patterns)

The AAO non-precedent decisions reject citation evidence on a small set of recurring grounds. Confirm the petition addresses each before filing:

- ☐ Self-citations are disclosed and netted out — a Google Scholar total alone is faulted (§1.1).
- ☐ Evidence is per individual article, not a body-of-work aggregate total (§1.2).
- ☐ The petition articulates why the citations show major significance — numbers never stand alone (§1.5).
- ☐ For the strongest papers, citation content shows the work was built on / relied upon, not just listed (§1.6, §2.2).
- ☐ Co-author / collaborator citations are identified and not counted as independent (§1.7).
- ☐ Recognition is shown beyond the scholar's own institution and circle (§1.8).
- ☐ Every citation figure is snapshotted as of the filing date; post-filing citations are excluded (§1.9).
- ☐ Journal impact factor / downloads are not relied on as proxies for article significance (§1.10, §1.12).
- ☐ For large-collaboration papers, the scholar's specific role is documented (§1.13).

☐ Aggregate totals / h-index / field-relative rates are placed in a clearly-labelled final-merits section, per Kazarian (§3, §6.1.7).

Disclaimer

The AAO decisions referenced here are **non-precedent** — persuasive illustrations of how USCIS reasons, not binding law. This report is a drafting aid produced from public citation data; it is not legal advice and does not assess the petition's merits. All analysis must be reviewed by qualified immigration counsel.

G. Citation Evidence Index

Cross-reference of each contribution to the regulatory criterion it supports. Counsel should map these to the petition's exhibit numbers.

Contribution	Core paper	Indep. cites	Supports
Contribution 1	US immigration westernizes the human gut microbiome	8	8 CFR 204.5(i)(3) — Outstanding Researcher