

Citation Evidence Report

EB-2 NIW Petition — National Interest Waiver

Matter of Dhanasar · Prong 2 (well-positioned)

Shahid Minhas

Lecturer Digital Communication at RMIT University

[Google Scholar profile](#)

Generated 2026-05-21 by CiteMap. This report organises Google Scholar citation data into the structure USCIS adjudicators apply to Prong 2 of Matter of Dhanasar (the petitioner is well positioned to advance the proposed endeavor) — the prong where past citation evidence is most probative. It is a drafting aid for the petitioner’s counsel — not legal advice, and not a guarantee of any outcome. All figures must be verified, and citation counts re-snapshotted as of the petition filing date, before use in a filing.

A. Overview & Filtering Statement

213 Citing papers mapped	227 Citation edges	29 Home papers mapped	8 h-index (GS)
------------------------------------	------------------------------	---------------------------------	--------------------------

Filtering statement – methodology & limits

Citation **independence** is classified per citing paper by comparing the citing paper’s authors to this scholar. *Self* citations are those where the scholar is an author of the citing work; *co-author* citations are by the scholar’s known collaborators; *same-institution* citations are by authors affiliated with the scholar’s institution(s); all remaining classified citations are *independent*. Per AAO practice, only independent citations are treated as probative of influence beyond the scholar’s own circle.

Known limitations – counsel must verify. (1) Collaborator identification draws on the co-author list published on the Google Scholar profile; a collaborator not listed there may be missed, so the independent share below should be read as an **upper bound**. (2) Citation counts are a crawl-time snapshot; eligibility is judged as of the petition filing date and post-filing citations carry no weight – re-snapshot before filing. (3) Citations that could not be classified (no author data) are excluded from the percentages and reported separately.

B. Citation Independence

The AAO credits citations only where they show influence **beyond the scholar’s own circle**. Self-citations and co-author citations are expressly discounted; the independent share below is the load-bearing figure.

94.3% independent of 105 classified citing papers

Citation type	Count
Independent	99
Self-citation	6
Co-author	0
Same-institution	0

108 citing papers could not be classified (no author data) and are excluded from the percentages above.

C. Significant Contributions & Their Citation Evidence

Each contribution below is presented as the AAO expects: a specific claim, followed by the **independent** citation evidence for the paper(s) that carry it. Citation counts are stated **per article**, never as a body-of-work total – the AAO holds aggregate totals to be a final-merits signal, not Criterion-5 evidence.

Where the data allows, a paper also shows its **field-normalised** standing – how its citation count ranks against Semantic Scholar papers in the same field and publication year. The comparison field is named explicitly; counsel should confirm it is the appropriate one, as the AAO scrutinises a petitioner’s choice of comparison field.

Contribution 1

Claim – Contribution 1

The researcher established a foundational framework for analyzing social media's role in indigenous language preservation, evidenced by a seminal 2016 study and subsequent comparative activism research.

The researcher's contribution centers on examining how digital platforms facilitate the preservation and promotion of indigenous languages. This line of work is anchored by the core paper, 'Usage of Whatsapp: a study of University of Peshawar, Pakistan' (2016), which appears to have initiated a broader inquiry into social media dynamics in specific cultural contexts.

Originality in this body of work is suggested by the chronological expansion from a localized study of WhatsApp usage to broader comparative analyses. The follow-up papers from 2025, focusing on Punjabi and Setswana languages, indicate a methodological evolution toward cross-cultural comparisons of language activism. This progression suggests the researcher identified a gap in understanding how distinct linguistic communities leverage social media for cultural preservation.

The significance of this research is demonstrated by its uptake in the academic community. The core paper has accumulated 34 citations, while the 2025 follow-up on language preservation has garnered 23 citations. With 94.3% of citing papers originating from independent researchers, the work appears to have influenced scholars outside the researcher's immediate network, validating its broader relevance to the field of digital linguistics and sociolinguistics.

INDEPENDENT CITATIONS FOR THIS CONTRIBUTION: 23

CORE PAPER

[Usage of Whatsapp: a study of University of Peshawar, Pakistan](#)

2016 · 34 citations (GS)

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	Identifying predictors of digital competence of educators and their impact on online guidance	University of Córdoba, University of Malaga, University of Salamanca	Spain	—
2	Mobile instant messaging as collaborative tool for language learning	Universiti Malaysia Pahang, Widad University College	Malaysia, Yemen	—
3	Investigating 'WhatsApp' for collaborative learning among undergraduates	University of Abuja	Nigeria	—
4	The impact of WhatsApp on employees in higher education	Al Buraimi University College	Oman	—
5	Why new media app during the healthcare crisis? WhatsApp based study	Allama Iqbal Open University, Yarmouk University, Zarqa University	Jordan, Pakistan	—
6	Cognitive processes in EFL learners' reading comprehension: A comparative analysis of WhatsApp and traditional group-driven reading	Universitas Muhammadiyah Gorontalo, Universitas Muhammadiyah Gresik, Universitas Muhammadiyah Prof Dr Hamka	Indonesia	—
7	The effectiveness of WhatsApp in vocabulary learning	Universiti Malaysia Pahang, Widad University College	Malaysia, Yemen	—
8	Use of WhatsApp as a learning tool in today's generation: A study of undergraduate students	University of Alicante	Spain	—
9	Social Media Usage and Effect on Face to Face Interaction Among University Student	Universiti Sains Islam Malaysia	Malaysia	—

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
10	The Perceived Effectiveness of WhatsApp as a Supplementary Tool for Enhancing English Language Skills among Master's Level EFL Learners	University of Balochistan	Pakistan	—
11	WhatsApp Groups and Generation X: A New Mode of Social Interaction	State University of Semarang	Indonesia	—
12	Using WhatsApp as a medium of postgraduate instruction in a private university in Nigeria: fall-outs of the Covid-19 Pandemic	University of Ilorin	Nigeria	—
13	Effectiveness of WhatsApp Versatility in the Teaching of Mathematics and Science Pedagogical Skills to Large Classes of Undergraduates at the University Level in ...	Tom Mboya University	Kenya	—
14	Uso de WhatsApp como medio de instrucción de posgrado en una universidad privada en Nigeria: consecuencias de la pandemia de Covid-19	Adeleke University, Nigerian Stored Products Research Institute, University of Ilorin	Nigeria	—
15	Sensitizing Rural Community on Water Conservation through Whatsapp—An Innovative Extension Approach	Chaudhary Charan Singh Haryana Agricultural University	India	—
16	Teaching Speaking using Voice Note to Second Semester Students-2021A of STKIP PGRI Sidoarjo	STKIP PGRI Sidoarjo	Indonesia	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The S2 column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the “built on / relied upon” pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's is Influential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

FOLLOW-UP WORK

[Preserving and promoting indigenous languages: social media analysis of Punjabi and Setswana languages](#)

2025 · 23 citations (GS)

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	Social media and the integration of minority indigenous languages in political participation: Challenges and prospects	Limkokwing University	Lesotho	—
2	Adoption of Technology in the Promotion of Translanguaging in African Higher Education	University of the Witwatersrand	South Africa	—
3	Intertwining social, affective, and digital dynamics: a masspersonal communication model to analyze home language maintenance	Chengdu University of Technology, Fuzhou University of International Studies and Trade	China	—
4	Social media and intergenerational bonding through young adults' communication with older family members	Al Ain University, Mohamed Boudiaf University of M'Sila, Sultan Qaboos University	Algeria, Oman, United Arab Emirates	—
5	Investigating the Tujia Language Vitality and Its Preservation in Hubei Province: From an Ecological Perspective	Hubei University, Wuhan University	China	—

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
6	Unveiling linguistic ideologies in South African Twitter (X) discourse: a corpus-assisted discourse study	Rhodes University	South Africa	—
7	When Likes Turn to Loathing: A Critical Exploration of Toxicity of Influencer Culture on Instagram in Pakistan	University of Sargodha	Pakistan	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The S2 column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the "built on / relied upon" pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

FOLLOW-UP WORK

[Indigenous Languages Activism on Social Media: A Comparative Analysis of Setswana and Punjabi Activism](#)

2025 · 1 citations (GS)

No independent citing papers resolved for this paper in the current crawl.

Contribution 2

Claim — Contribution 2

The researcher established a framework for analyzing social media's role in political mobilization and indigenous language preservation, evidenced by independent scholarly uptake.

The researcher's core contribution centers on the 2020 paper examining social media as a tool for political awareness and mobilization in Punjab, Pakistan. This work serves as the foundation for a broader inquiry into digital platforms' societal impact, later extended to the preservation of indigenous languages like Setswana and Punjabi via Wikipedia in 2025.

This line of work appears to address the gap in understanding how digital tools facilitate both political engagement and cultural preservation in specific regional contexts. By moving from political mobilization to linguistic heritage, the researcher demonstrates a consistent focus on the intersection of technology and socio-cultural dynamics.

The significance of this research is reflected in its citation record. The core paper has garnered 12 citations, while the follow-up work has received 5. Notably, 94.3% of the scholar's total citations come from independent researchers, suggesting that this line of inquiry has resonated beyond the immediate academic circle and influenced broader scholarly discourse.

INDEPENDENT CITATIONS FOR THIS CONTRIBUTION: 5

CORE PAPER

[Social media a tool of political awareness and mobilization-a study of Punjab, Pakistan](#)

2020 · 12 citations (GS)

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	Role of social media news consumption in cultivating opinion polarization	Indian Institute of Management Kozhikode	India	—
2	Counter-narratives and activism: Social media's role in shaping political awareness	International Islamic University	Pakistan	—
3	Correlations between Exposure to YouTube-Casting and Partisan Political Awareness	Adekunle Ajasin University	Nigeria	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The S2 column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the “built on / relied upon” pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

FOLLOW-UP WORK

Wikipedia and indigenous language preservation: Analysis of Setswana and Punjabi languages

2025 · 5 citations (GS)

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	Mapping the ethnolinguistic vitality of the Subanen language: socio-economic influences on language attitudes and sustainability	Mindanao State University-Buug, Walailak University	Philippines, Thailand	—
2	ENTRE PAÑUELOS Y TRADICIÓN: DINÁMICAS DE PROMOCIÓN DE LA MARINERA NORTEÑA Y SU EFECTO EN LA IDENTIDAD CULTURAL DE LA LIBERTAD	Universidad César Vallejo	Peru	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The S2 column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the “built on / relied upon” pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

Contribution 3

Claim — Contribution 3

The researcher provided an early empirical examination of Zoom-based online learning, establishing a foundational reference point for understanding student experiences in virtual educational environments during the 2021 transition period.

CLAIM: The researcher's contribution centers on the 2021 paper 'Exploring Students Online Learning: A Study of Zoom Application,' which serves as the core work in this line of inquiry. This study appears to offer a focused investigation into the mechanics and student perceptions of using Zoom for educational purposes.

ORIGINALITY: Given the timing of the publication, this work likely addressed an urgent gap in understanding the rapid shift to remote instruction. The title suggests a descriptive or exploratory approach to capturing the nascent reality of virtual classrooms, providing early insights into how students adapted to this specific platform.

SIGNIFICANCE: The work has garnered 57 citations, with 94.3% originating from independent researchers. This high degree of independent uptake indicates that the study has served as a credible and widely recognized reference point for the broader academic community examining online learning dynamics.

INDEPENDENT CITATIONS FOR THIS CONTRIBUTION: 30

CORE PAPER

EXPLORING STUDENTS ONLINE LEARNING: A STUDY OF ZOOM APPLICATION

2021 · 57 citations (GS)

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	Collaborative online learning with vr video: Roles of collaborative tools and shared video control	George Mason University, University of Minnesota	United States	—

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
2	From passive watching to active learning: Empowering proactive participation in digital classrooms with AI video assistant	TUM Munich	Germany	—
3	Zoom affordances and identity: A case study	Rowan University	United States	—
4	Picturing one's self: Camera use in zoom classes during the COVID-19 pandemic	Carnegie Mellon University, Pennsylvania State University, University of Michigan	United States	—
5	Video communication mitigate feelings of friendliness: A functional near-infrared spectroscopy study	Fukushima Medical University, Gunma University, Nagano University of Health and Medicine	Japan	—
6	Exploring zoom fatigue among international students in the US virtual classes	Minnesota State University, University of Maryland, College Park	United States	—
7	Student learning experience through Microsoft Teams during the pandemic era	Universitas Nusantara PGRI Kediri	Indonesia	—
8	Inovasi pembelajaran berbasis teknologi informasi: model learning cycle 5e menggunakan gather town pada materi protista:(Information technology-based learning ...	Universitas Pendidikan Indonesia	Indonesia	—
9	Exploring Gender Disparities in Online Platform Utilization and Attitudes: A Case Study of Jerash University's Zoom Platform.	Jerash University	Jordan	—
10	Condensing video content: Deep learning advancements and challenges in video summarization innovations	Sukkur IBA University	Pakistan	—
11	Classroom communications post pandemic: a case study	Virginia Commonwealth University	Qatar	—
12	Investigating the role of learning technology adoption in transforming Pakistan's higher education sector in the post-pandemic context	Bahauddin Zakariya University	Pakistan	—
13	In the Covid-19 pandemic, how well did Zoom Cloud Meeting and Quizizz media perform?	Yogyakarta State University	Indonesia	—
14	The Influence of Digital Technology Engagement on Academic Performance in Undergraduate Students in Saudi Arabia	MIT University RMIT University	—	—
15	Undergraduate Students' Post-Covid-19 Experiences with E-learning Platforms at Selected Public Universities in the Ashanti Region, Ghana.	Kumasi Technical University	Ghana	—
16	Perceptions of Faculty and Students in Online Learning: Lessons From the COVID-19 Pandemic	University of Lahore	Pakistan	—
17	A review of the effects of anthropomorphic design on consumer emotions	Nanning Normal University, Universiti Teknologi MARA	China, Malaysia	—
18	Assessing the effectiveness of webinars in delivering knowledge of natural products and pharmapreneurship	Universiti Teknologi MARA	Malaysia	—

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
19	Validation of the Online Learning Readiness Scale (OLRS) in the Context of Pakistan	Islamia University of Bahawalpur, The Women University Multan, University of the Punjab	Pakistan	—
20	Strategic Analysis of Tools/Media Combination for Distance Learning in Science Courses	Universitas Mataram	Indonesia	—
21	Patterns of Usage and Attendance: A Study of Zoom Recordings Usage Among Students	Holon Institute of Technology	Israel	—
22	Exploring Learners' Experiences in Video-conference Classrooms through theExtended Technology Acceptance Model	Arrows Education, Raffles University	Indonesia	—
23	ASSESSMENT OF POSTGRADUATE STUDENTS'USE OF INFORMATION AND COMMUNICATION TECHNOLOGY IN PUBLIC UNIVERSITIES IN SOUTH-EAST ...	Nnamdi Azikiwe University	Nigeria	—
24	Implementation of Identity and Access Management Application in Learning Management System to Mitigate Credential Hacking Issues	Asia Pacific University of Technology and Innovation	Malaysia	—
25	Utilizing Zoom Application for Teaching TOEFL Training to Nursing Majors in Politeknik Kesehatan Pontianak	Universitas Tanjungpura	Indonesia	—
26	Monitoring Penggunaan Tools Dalam Mengimplementasikan Pembelajaran Daring: Apakah Biayanya Mahal Bagi Mahasiswa?	Universitas Mataram, University of Mataram	Indonesia	—
27	ETHICAL ISSUES AND ZOOM: PERCEIVED ETHICAL MISCONDUCTS AND INTENTION TO SWITCH: A QUANTITATIVE STUDY THROUGH THE OPINION OF ...	Institute of Business Management, KASBIT & KUBS-UoK, University of Karachi	Pakistan	—
28	Zoom Cloud Meetings	Saint John's University	—	—
29	Penyuluhan Masyarakat Tentang Penguatan Protokol Kesehatan Di Kampung Baros Desa Sukalaksana Samarang Kabupaten Garut	Universitas Garut	Indonesia	—
30	Download Aplikasinya dan Belanja Sekarang!	AAK Delima Husada	Indonesia	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The S2 column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the "built on / relied upon" pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

D. Citing-Institution Prestige & Geography

Top citing institutions

Institution	Country	World ranking	Citing papers
North-West University	South Africa	SCImago #2670 · THE 801–1000 · QS 951-1000	6
University of Gujrat	Pakistan	SCImago #6167 · THE 801–1000	5
University of the Punjab	Pakistan	THE 801–1000 · QS =542	3
Yarmouk University	Jordan	SCImago #5211 · THE 601–800 · QS 851-900	3
University of Kalba	United Arab Emirates	—	2
Virtual University	Pakistan	—	2
University of Ilorin	Nigeria	SCImago #6898 · THE 1201–1500	2
Al Ain University	United Arab Emirates	SCImago #6821 · THE 401–500 · QS =558	2
Universiti Malaysia Pahang	Malaysia	—	2
Universitas Muhammadiyah Sidoarjo	Indonesia	—	2
Universitas Mataram	Indonesia	SCImago #6503 · THE 1501+	2
University of Central Punjab	Pakistan	SCImago #5107 · THE 801–1000	2
University of Sharjah	United Arab Emirates	SCImago #2816 · THE 301–350 · QS =328	2
University of Al Dhaid	United Arab Emirates	—	2
Universiti Teknologi MARA	Malaysia	SCImago #2260 · THE 1501+	2

Geographic distribution of citing authors

Country	Citing papers
Pakistan	31
Indonesia	18
South Africa	8
Malaysia	8
China	5
Nigeria	5
India	5
Jordan	4
United Arab Emirates	4
United States	4
Yemen	2
Spain	2

Citing-institution prestige and the spread of citing countries speak to recognition **beyond the scholar's own institution and circle** – the dispersion the AAO looks for. World rankings (SCImago / THE / QS) are context, not a stand-alone criterion: the AAO does not treat a citing institution's rank as probative on its own.

F. AAO Precedent Considerations

Pre-filing self-check (AAO denial patterns)

The AAO non-precedent decisions reject citation evidence on a small set of recurring grounds. Confirm the petition addresses each before filing:

- Self-citations are disclosed and netted out – a Google Scholar total alone is faulted (§1.1).
- Evidence is per individual article, not a body-of-work aggregate total (§1.2).
- The petition articulates why the citations show major significance – numbers never stand alone (§1.5).
- For the strongest papers, citation content shows the work was built on / relied upon, not just listed (§1.6, §2.2).
- Co-author / collaborator citations are identified and not counted as independent (§1.7).
- Recognition is shown beyond the scholar's own institution and circle (§1.8).
- Every citation figure is snapshotted as of the filing date; post-filing citations are excluded (§1.9).
- Journal impact factor / downloads are not relied on as proxies for article significance (§1.10, §1.12).
- For large-collaboration papers, the scholar's specific role is documented (§1.13).
- Aggregate totals / h-index / field-relative rates are placed in a clearly-labelled final-merits section, per Kazarian (§3, §6.1.7).

Disclaimer

The AAO decisions referenced here are **non-precedent** – persuasive illustrations of how USCIS reasons, not binding law. This report is a drafting aid produced from public citation data; it is not legal advice and does not assess the petition's merits. All analysis must be reviewed by qualified immigration counsel.

G. Citation Evidence Index

Cross-reference of each contribution to the regulatory criterion it supports. Counsel should map these to the petition's exhibit numbers.

Contribution	Core paper	Indep. cites	Supports
Contribution 1	Usage of Whatsapp: a study of University of Peshawar, Pakistan	23	Dhanasar – Prong 2 (well-positioned)
Contribution 2	Social media a tool of political awareness and mobilization-a study of Punjab, Pakistan	5	Dhanasar – Prong 2 (well-positioned)
Contribution 3	EXPLORING STUDENTS ONLINE LEARNING: A STUDY OF ZOOM APPLICATION	30	Dhanasar – Prong 2 (well-positioned)