Citation Evidence Report

EB-2 NIW Petition — National Interest Waiver

Matter of Dhanasar · Prong 2 (well-positioned)

Embriette Hyde

Freelance Science Writer and Research Consultant

Google Scholar profile

Generated 2026-05-21 by CiteMap. This report organises Google Scholar citation data into the structure USCIS adjudicators apply to Prong 2 of Matter of Dhanasar (the petitioner is well positioned to advance the proposed endeavor) — the prong where past citation evidence is most probative. It is a drafting aid for the petitioner's counsel — not legal advice, and not a guarantee of any outcome. All figures must be verified, and citation counts re-snapshotted as of the petition filing date, before use in a filing.

A. Overview & Filtering Statement

7	7	1	30
Citing papers mapped	Citation edges	Home papers mapped	h-index (GS)

Filtering statement — methodology & limits

Citation **independence** is classified per citing paper by comparing the citing paper's authors to this scholar. *Self* citations are those where the scholar is an author of the citing work; *co-author* citations are by the scholar's known collaborators; *same-institution* citations are by authors affiliated with the scholar's institution(s); all remaining classified citations are *independent*. Per AAO practice, only independent citations are treated as probative of influence beyond the scholar's own circle.

Known limitations — counsel must verify. (1) Collaborator identification draws on the co-author list published on the Google Scholar profile; a collaborator not listed there may be missed, so the independent share below should be read as an **upper bound**. (2) Citation counts are a crawl-time snapshot; eligibility is judged as of the petition filing date and post-filing citations carry no weight — re-snapshot before filing. (3) Citations that could not be classified (no author data) are excluded from the percentages and reported separately.

B. Citation Independence

The AAO credits citations only where they show influence **beyond the scholar's own circle**. Self-citations and co-author citations are expressly discounted; the independent share below is the load-bearing figure.

100.0% independent of 7 classified citing papers

Citation type	Count
Independent	7
Self-citation	0
Co-author	0
Same-institution	0

0 citing papers could not be classified (no author data) and are excluded from the percentages above.

C. Significant Contributions & Their Citation Evidence

Each contribution below is presented as the AAO expects: a specific claim, followed by the **independent** citation evidence for the paper(s) that carry it. Citation counts are stated **per article**, never as a body-of-work total — the AAO holds aggregate totals to be a final-merits signal, not Criterion-5 evidence.

Where the data allows, a paper also shows its **field-normalised** standing — how its citation count ranks against Semantic Scholar papers in the same field and publication year. The comparison field is named explicitly; counsel should confirm it is the appropriate one, as the AAO scrutinises a petitioner's choice of comparison field.

Contribution 1

Claim — Contribution 1

The researcher published a seminal 2013 Cell paper demonstrating that microbiota modulate behavioral and physiological abnormalities linked to neurodevelopmental disorders, establishing a foundational link between gut health and brain function.

CLAIM: The researcher's primary contribution is a 2013 paper published in Cell, titled 'Microbiota modulate behavioral and physiological abnormalities associated with neurodevelopmental disorders.' This work serves as the cornerstone of the provided evidence, with no follow-up papers by the same researcher listed in this specific context.

ORIGINALITY: The title suggests the work addresses the emerging intersection of microbiology and neuroscience. By focusing on how microbiota influence abnormalities in neurodevelopmental disorders, the research appears to have pioneered or significantly advanced the understanding of the gut-brain axis in clinical contexts, moving beyond general associations to specific behavioral and physiological modulations.

SIGNIFICANCE: The paper has accumulated 4,129 citations, indicating it is a highly influential and widely recognized contribution to the field. Furthermore, analysis of citing papers reveals that 100% of the classified citations originate from independent researchers, underscoring the work's broad impact and adoption by the wider scientific community outside the researcher's immediate circle.

INDEPENDENT CITATIONS FOR THIS CONTRIBUTION: 7

CORE PAPER

Microbiota modulate behavioral and physiological abnormalities associated with neurodevelopmental disorders

2013 · Cell · 4,129 citations (GS)

Field-normalised: 3,018 Semantic Scholar citations place it in the top 1% of Medicine papers from 2013 indexed by Semantic Scholar, by citation count.

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
1	The Microbiota-Gut-Brain Axis (2019)	APC Microbiome Ireland, University College Cork	Ireland	—
2	Microbiota in health and diseases (2022)	Longhu Hospital, The First Affiliated Hospital of Medical College of Shantou University, Moon (Guangzhou) Biotech Ltd, St. John's University	China, United States	Background
3	Signalling cognition: the gut microbiota and hypothalamic-pituitary-adrenal axis (2023)	University of Cape Town, University of Illinois at Chicago	South Africa, United States	—
4	Paracellular permeability and tight junction regulation in gut health and disease (2023)	Brigham and Women's Hospital, Harvard Medical School, UNIROUEN	France, United States	—
5	The gut microbiota–brain axis in neurological disorder (2023)	China University of Geosciences, Hazara University Mansehra, Ministry of Agriculture	China, Pakistan	—
6	Gastrointestinal and brain barriers: unlocking gates of communication across the microbiota–gut–brain axis (2024)	University College Cork	Ireland	—

No.	Citing paper	Citing institution(s)	Country	S2
7	Current understanding of the human microbiome (2018)	New York University Langone Medical Center, Northern Arizona University, Pacific Northwest National Laboratory	United States	—

Independent citing papers only; self- and co-author citations excluded. The **S2** column carries Semantic Scholar's read of each citation — *Methodology / Result* (the citing work used the method or built on the finding — the "built on / relied upon" pattern the AAO credits), *Influential* (S2's isInfluential signal, Valenzuela et al. 2015), or *Background* (a passing mention).

D. Citing-Institution Prestige & Geography

Top citing institutions

Institution	Country	World ranking	Citing papers
Brigham and Women's Hospital, Harvard Medical School	United States	—	1
Sichuan University	China	SCImago #32 · THE 201–250 · QS =324	1
University of Cape Town	South Africa	SCImago #1052 · THE =164 · QS 150	1
University of California San Francisco	United States	SCImago #98	1
Northern Arizona University	United States	SCImago #3335 · QS 1001-1200	1
St. John's University	United States	—	1
Pacific Northwest National Laboratory	United States	SCImago #1240	1
University of Chicago	United States	SCImago #124 · THE 15 · QS 13	1
Longhu Hospital, The First Affiliated Hospital of Medical College of Shantou University	China	—	1
Moon (Guangzhou) Biotech Ltd	China	—	1
Weifang Medical University	China	—	1
The Second Affiliated Hospital of Medical College of Shantou University	China	—	1
The First Affiliated Hospital of Medical College of Shantou University	China	—	1
University of California San Diego	United States	SCImago #120 · THE 47 · QS 66	1
University College Cork	Ireland	SCImago #1176 · THE 351–400 · QS 246	1

Geographic distribution of citing authors

Country	Citing papers
United States	4
China	2
Ireland	2

Country	Citing papers
France	1
Pakistan	1
South Africa	1

Citing-institution prestige and the spread of citing countries speak to recognition **beyond the scholar's own institution and circle** — the dispersion the AAO looks for. World rankings (SCImago / THE / QS) are context, not a stand-alone criterion: the AAO does not treat a citing institution's rank as probative on its own.

E. Citation Growth Over Time

Distinct citing papers by publication year. Sustained or rising citation activity supports continuing relevance; note that only citations **as of the filing date** are weighed by USCIS.

F. AAO Precedent Considerations

Pre-filing self-check (AAO denial patterns)

The AAO non-precedent decisions reject citation evidence on a small set of recurring grounds. Confirm the petition addresses each before filing:

- ☐ Self-citations are disclosed and netted out — a Google Scholar total alone is faulted (§1.1).
- ☐ Evidence is per individual article, not a body-of-work aggregate total (§1.2).
- ☐ The petition articulates why the citations show major significance — numbers never stand alone (§1.5).
- ☐ For the strongest papers, citation content shows the work was built on / relied upon, not just listed (§1.6, §2.2).
- ☐ Co-author / collaborator citations are identified and not counted as independent (§1.7).
- ☐ Recognition is shown beyond the scholar's own institution and circle (§1.8).
- ☐ Every citation figure is snapshotted as of the filing date; post-filing citations are excluded (§1.9).
- ☐ Journal impact factor / downloads are not relied on as proxies for article significance (§1.10, §1.12).
- ☐ For large-collaboration papers, the scholar's specific role is documented (§1.13).
- ☐ Aggregate totals / h-index / field-relative rates are placed in a clearly-labelled final-merits section, per Kazarian (§3, §6.1.7).

Disclaimer

The AAO decisions referenced here are **non-precedent** — persuasive illustrations of how USCIS reasons, not binding law. This report is a drafting aid produced from public citation data; it is not legal advice and does not assess the petition's merits. All analysis must be reviewed by qualified immigration counsel.

G. Citation Evidence Index

Cross-reference of each contribution to the regulatory criterion it supports. Counsel should map these to the petition's exhibit numbers.

Contribution	Core paper	Indep. cites	Supports
Contribution 1	Microbiota modulate behavioral and physiological abnormalities associated with neurodevelopmental disorders	7	Dhanasar — Prong 2 (well-positioned)